

## Appendix C

### List of Specific Research Questions Identified at the Start of the Evaluation



## Specific Research Questions Related to the Context of the Pilots

### 1. What employer characteristics are relevant to evaluating the pilots?

#### a. *Descriptive information*

- (1) Employment sector (e.g., Federal Government, private industry)
- (2) Industry of employer
- (3) Financial well-being of the firm
- (4) Unionization status
- (5) Organization size
- (6) Organizational profitability/financial well-being
- (7) Organizational structure
  - (a) Multinational, national, regional, or local firm
  - (b) Decentralization
  - (c) Formality
- (8) Whether to use “just-in-time” production
- (9) Extent to which subcontractors are utilized
- (10) Degree of human resources automation
- (11) Size of human resources staff
- (12) Level of computerization
- (13) Working conditions
- (14) Extent of formal grievance procedures
- (15) Rate of staff turnover
- (16) Wage levels
- (17) Skill level of positions
- (18) Management culture
- (19) Proportion of immigrants in management and among employees
- (20) Seasonal and temporary nature of work

#### b. *Previous behavior characteristics*

- (1) History of INS audit/sweeps/fines
- (2) History of OSHA fines/investigations
- (3) History of pollution inquiries/fines/emissions
- (4) History of discrimination complaints

#### c. *Reputation of firm*

- (1) Reputation for discrimination in hiring
- (2) Reputation for discrimination in training
- (3) Reputation for discrimination in promotion

### 2. What employee and applicant characteristics are relevant to evaluating the pilots?

#### a. *Demographic characteristics*

- (1) Race
- (2) Ethnicity
- (3) Gender
- (4) Age
- (5) Marital status
- (6) Dependent children or parents
- (7) Disability status

- (8) Country of origin
    - (9) Conditions of the primary immigrant group's country of national origin
  - b. *Characteristics related to work authorization*
    - (1) Percentage of unauthorized employees in the firm
    - (2) Percentage of work-authorized employees who do not have the required documentation
    - (3) Percentage of employees who have counterfeit documents
    - (4) Types of counterfeit documents used
    - (5) Percentage of employees who have documents belonging to others
  - c. *Skill level and work characteristics*
    - (1) Educational level
    - (2) Skill level
    - (3) Socioeconomic status
    - (4) Job attendance/tardiness
    - (5) Performance on the job
    - (6) Rate of job grievances/complaints filed
    - (7) Job satisfaction
    - (8) Self-esteem
    - (9) Literacy level (both English and any language)
- 3. What INS and SSA district office characteristics are relevant to evaluating the pilots?**
- a. *General characteristics*
    - (1) Accessibility to employers
    - (2) Responsiveness to employer's inquiry/complaint
    - (3) Accessibility to individuals
    - (4) Responsiveness to individual's inquiry/complaint
    - (5) Accuracy of files and databases maintained in local offices
    - (6) Menu pattern of telephone access system
    - (7) Length of time to return calls
    - (8) Extent to which original documents are demanded
    - (9) Extent to which receipts for original documents are provided
    - (10) Expediency of problem resolution
    - (11) Rate of lost documents
    - (12) Ambience of office
  - b. *Relation between INS district offices and law enforcement efforts*
    - (1) Frequency/extent of INS audits
    - (2) Frequency/extent of INS sweeps
- 4. What community characteristics are relevant to evaluating the pilots?**
- a. *Demographic and economic characteristics*
    - (1) Education level
    - (2) Income level
    - (3) Housing cost
    - (4) Unemployment rate
    - (5) Homeless density
    - (6) Poverty rate
    - (7) Size of immigrant and undocumented population

- (8) Racial composition
  - (9) Age composition
  - (10) Presence of single dominant employer in community
  - b. *Geographical and density characteristics*
    - (1) Region of the country
    - (2) Community size
    - (3) Population density
    - (4) Proximity to land border
    - (5) Proximity to water border
  - c. *Infrastructure characteristics*
    - (1) Extent to which higher education facilities exist in the community
    - (2) Extent of high-technology infrastructure
    - (3) Extent of police presence (strength/population)
    - (4) Extent to which police follow rules in the community
    - (5) Number of jails/prisons, and the prison population density
    - (6) Distance from nearest INS offices
    - (7) Frequency of INS sweeps in locale
    - (8) Industry composition in community
  - d. *Extent of underground economy*
    - (1) Ease of obtaining false documents
    - (2) Extent of permitted crime (drugs, prostitution, stolen or untaxed items)
    - (3) Extent of non-permitted crime
  - e. *Community political and cultural orientation*
    - (1) Existence of anti-immigration sentiment
    - (2) Existence of race problems
    - (3) Community's political voting pattern (conservative, liberal, etc.)
    - (4) Presence of active community centers and groups
    - (5) Presence of church groups active in community
- 5. What public opinion characteristics are relevant to evaluating the pilots?**
- a. *Public perception of immigration and government*
    - (1) Whether people believe there is an immigration problem
    - (2) Whether people believe the government will reduce illegal immigration
  - b. *Public perception of pilot projects*
    - (1) Whether people believe the pilots are a strategy that will lead to a national identity card
    - (2) Whether people believe the pilots represent an expansion of government
    - (3) Whether people see this as a new burden on taxpayers
    - (4) Whether people believe the pilots will open opportunities for work-authorized persons
    - (5) Whether people believe the pilots will decrease employment of non-work-authorized persons
    - (6) Whether people see the pilots as an unwarranted intrusion
    - (7) Whether people see the pilots as an unduly burdensome regulatory requirement
    - (8) Whether people see the pilots as forcing employees out of work

- (9) Whether people are concerned about who has access to this information
- (10) Whether people are concerned about how this information will be used
- c. *Community leaders' opinions of the pilots and immigration*
  - (1) Extent to which local leaders express strong views about immigration
  - (2) Extent to which local leaders express strong views about the pilots
  - (3) Extent to which local leaders express strong views about governmental intrusiveness
  - (4) Extent to which local leaders express strong views about taxpayer burden
- 6. **What other contextual factors should be considered in the evaluation?**
  - a. *What other changes in federally mandated procedures occurred during the time that the pilot programs were being implemented that might affect the pilot programs?*
  - b. *What technological changes occurred during the time that the pilot programs were being implemented that might affect the pilot programs?*

## Specific Research Questions Related to Pilot Performance

1. **Do employers follow the required employment verification procedures?**
  - a. *What procedures are employers supposed to follow?*
    - (1) As articulated by Congress?
    - (2) As articulated by INS and SSA?
  - b. *Do employers follow the established procedures?*
    - (1) Do employers follow the correct sequence of verification steps required for the pilot?
    - (2) At what point in the process do employers consider an individual to be “hired”?
    - (3) When does the employee fill out the Form I-9?
    - (4) What do employers do if employees provide documents that do not appear to belong to them?
    - (5) How frequently do employers challenge the authenticity of the documents?
    - (6) Are there certain types of legitimate documents that employers are frequently questioning?
    - (7) Are employers entering data accurately?
    - (8) When employers receive a tentative nonconfirmation, do they rectify any keying errors before proceeding?
    - (9) Are employers completing the process in a timely (as scheduled) manner?
    - (10) Do employers inform initially non-confirmed employees immediately?
    - (11) Do employers inform such employees that they may remain employed pending verification of final outcome?
    - (12) Do employers provide such referral forms as are needed, correctly filled out?
    - (13) Do employers permit employees to use company telephones and fax machines to contact INS and/or SSA?
    - (14) Do employers provide appropriate time off for employees to contest the initial nonconfirmation?
    - (15) Do employers wait for final nonconfirmation before terminating employees for work-authorization reasons?
    - (16) Do employers take any other adverse actions (e.g., pay cuts, layoffs, not providing training) against employees while waiting for final verification outcome?
    - (17) Do employers who retain employees who have received final nonconfirmation report this to INS?
    - (18) Do employers train their human resources clerks in the pilot process?
    - (19) Do employers train the individuals who interact with employees in the pilot process (i.e., hiring personnel, shop floor personnel), and to what extent?
    - (20) Do employers request additional training or materials from INS as needed?

- (21) Do employers make provisions for continued organizational compliance with pilot procedures when there is staff turnover?
  - (22) Do employers allocate appropriate resources and facilities for the pilots?
  - (23) Do employers understand their obligations to the pilot projects?
  - (24) Do employers ignore certain instructions because they are not practical to implement?
  - c. *Do employers establish additional procedures as a result of participating in the pilots?*
    - (1) Are job candidates suspected of being non-verifiable simply turned away, with no record of their application for a job?
    - (2) Do employers prescreen applicants?
    - (3) Do employers assume that initially non-verified employees are unauthorized?
    - (4) Do employers discourage employees from contesting initial non-verification?
    - (5) Do employers penalize workers for taking time off to reconcile verification?
    - (6) Do employers require extra documentation, or refuse to accept documentation that appears valid on its face?
    - (7) Is there evidence that some employers provide undocumented applicants with valid documents?
    - (8) Do employers report employees who fail primary verification for arrest or deportation?
    - (9) Do employers submit existing employees for verification?
    - (10) How have employer procedures changed over the course of the pilot? At whose instigation?
    - (11) Do employers participating in the pilot programs find it necessary to modify procedures in ways not identified above?
  - d. *Are employers who follow requirements different from those who don't and, if so, how?*
    - (1) Are the quantity and recentness of training correlated with effective implementation of the pilot?
    - (2) Does training reduce the incidence of data entry errors on the employer's part?
  - e. *Do employees, community members, and other stakeholders believe that employers are implementing the pilots correctly?*
- 2. Do employees follow the required employment verification procedures?**
- a. *What procedures are employees supposed to follow?*
    - (1) As articulated by Congress?
    - (2) As articulated by INS and SSA?
  - b. *Do employees follow the established procedures?*
    - (1) Do employees provide appropriate documentation promptly?
      - (a) What is the rate of using counterfeit documents?
      - (b) What is the impersonation rate?



- (c) How frequently are work-authorized persons unable to provide appropriate documentation?
      - (d) Are there instances of work-authorized persons using fraudulent documents because they want to evade detection for other reasons?
    - (2) Are work-authorized persons contesting initial non-verification?
    - (3) Are work-authorized persons remaining at work while they contest initial non-verification? If not, why not?
    - (4) Do work-authorized persons contact INS and/or SSA promptly to reconcile their records? If not, why not?
    - (5) Do employees understand their rights?
    - (6) If not all employees understand their rights, are problems especially severe for some subgroups (e.g., migrant laborers)?
    - (7) If employees don't understand their rights, is it because they didn't receive information, could not understand the information because of a lack of English proficiency, or another reason?
    - (8) Do work-authorized persons ignore certain processes because they are impractical?
  - c. *Do employees otherwise modify their behavior as a result of the pilot programs?*
    - (1) Do work-authorized employees avoid applying to firms that participate in the pilot?
    - (2) Do some work-authorized employees who are not initially confirmed fail to follow procedures, because they believe it would be easier to obtain employment from employers not participating in the pilots?
    - (3) Do some work-authorized employees who are not initially confirmed fail to appeal, because they don't have the time or resources needed to appeal their nonconfirmation?
    - (4) Do work-authorized persons move to firms that are not participating in the pilots?
    - (5) Are work-authorized persons unable to get taxpaying jobs because of the pilot projects, their documentation requirements, or how the pilots are implemented?
3. **Do INS and SSA operate in an efficient and timely fashion in administering the employment verification system?**
- a. *Do INS and SSA provide accurate recruitment information to employers?*
    - (1) Do INS advertising materials accurately portray the rules and processes of the employment verification process?
    - (2) Why do employers agree to participate in the pilot?
    - (3) Why do some employers who sign the Memorandum of Understanding apparently not use the system?
  - b. *Do INS and SSA ensure that employees and potential employees receive the information they need to understand their rights and obligations under the employment verification process?*
    - (1) Do INS and SSA conduct media or other campaigns to inform the public about the program?

- (2) What do INS and SSA do to ensure that employers are providing employees and applicants with appropriate information?
- (3) Do INS and SSA make special efforts to inform groups with special needs, such as migrant workers, non-English-speaking individuals, and individuals with disabilities?
- (4) To what extent are community members aware of the pilots and employee rights and responsibilities under the pilots?
- c. *How long does it take INS and SSA to respond to:*
  - (1) Initial employer inquiries?
  - (2) Secondary inquiries from employers?
  - (3) Requests for reconciliation of initial non-verification from employees?
- d. *How well do INS and SSA provide help to those needing assistance?*
  - (1) How easy is it to get through on INS and SSA telephone numbers?
  - (2) Do the INS and SSA telephone systems efficiently direct the caller to an agent who can assist in the problem?
  - (3) If employees go to a local INS or SSA office, how long do they have to wait to talk to an agent who can assist in the problem?
  - (4) Does INS provide an adequate number of foreign-language speakers as agents to help resolve contested records?
  - (5) Do INS and SSA operate in a helpful and supportive manner when working with individuals contesting initial non-verification?
  - (6) Do INS and SSA offices block or discourage inquiries?
  - (7) Do INS and SSA provide some employers with better service than other employers and, if so, which employers receive better service?
  - (8) Do INS and SSA permit the person contesting non-verification to keep his/her original documentation, or provide a receipt for that documentation?
  - (9) How much training, assistance, and resources do INS and SSA devote to pilot employers?
  - (10) How much training, assistance, and resources do INS and SSA devote to pilot employees?
  - (11) Does INS provide as much training to pilot employers and employees as is needed for the pilots to work efficiently?
  - (12) Do INS and SSA provide adequate training to their own employees in how to fulfill their employment verification responsibilities?
  - (13) Does INS allocate sufficient equipment and facilities for the pilots?
  - (14) Are there enough agents to accommodate inquiries?
  - (15) How frequently, if at all, do INS and SSA lose documents?
  - (16) Do INS and SSA employees ignore certain procedures because they are not practical to implement?
- e. *What are the number and types of outputs from the employment verification process?*
  - (1) How many employees are verified at each step of the verification process?
  - (2) How many employees fail verification at each step of the verification process?

- f. *What are the causes of observed inaccuracies in INS and SSA databases?*
  - (1) What is the rate of data entry errors and lost data (never entered) in the databases used for employment verification?
  - (2) Do INS and SSA have systematic procedures to collect and enter data into their databases?
  - (3) Do INS and SSA know how much inaccuracy is in their respective systems?
  - (4) How quickly is new status information entered into the INS database following adjudication of a case?
  - (5) Do Federal agencies have enough resources to carry out their responsibilities?
  - (6) Do INS and SSA have continuous measurement and continuous improvement procedures in place?
  - (7) Do INS and SSA have external audit procedures that verify the accuracy and efficiency of their systems and procedures?
  - (8) Does the accuracy of outputs vary depending upon employer, employee, Federal office, or community characteristics?
- g. *Are the rates at which employees drop out or quit after initial non-verification lower in areas with relatively effective INS and SSA local offices?*
- h. *How well do DOL, INS, and SSA work together?*
- i. *Will the value of deterring unauthorized workers overtake the priorities and values of other agencies, such as workers' rights?*
- j. *What does it mean if an employer is kicked out of the pilot? Does this happen and, if so, what is the government follow-up?*
- 4. **Do the INS and SSA tracking systems point to any problems in implementing the pilot programs?**
  - a. *How accurate are the outputs of the employment verification systems?*
    - (1) What is the incidence of unauthorized persons being authorized to work?
    - (2) What is the incidence of authorized persons not being verified at each step?
    - (3) What are the causes of initial nonconfirmation of work-authorized employees?
    - (4) What is the incidence of authorized persons quitting or being fired prior to the final determination of eligibility?
    - (5) What percentage of employees who quit after receiving tentative nonconfirmation without seeking secondary verification were actually work-authorized?
    - (6) What are the various reasons that people are failing the first phase (e.g., name discrepancy, date of birth, death data, data not entered in a timely manner by SSA or INS)?
  - b. *How accurate is the final determination of eligibility for employees contesting initial non-verification?*

- (1) Do the INS administrators assigned to follow up on verification challenges go beyond a simple review of the data punched into the verification system in the first place?
- c. *Is the number of employees entered in the verification databases consistent with what is expected from employer records?*
- d. *What are the number (and rate) of initial confirmations?*
- e. *What percentage of initial nonconfirmations appear to be attributable to employer data entry errors?*
- f. *What percentage of initial nonconfirmations are submitted for secondary verification?*
- g. *What percentage of initial nonconfirmations are confirmed on secondary verification?*
- h. *What percentage of secondary nonconfirmations are appealed?*
- i. *What percentage of appealed cases result in confirmation of the employee's work authorization?*

## Specific Research Questions Related to Costs

1. **What are the costs of the pilot programs?**
  - a. *Compared to the current employment verification program, what are the financial costs of implementing and maintaining pilot programs for:*
    - (1) Employers?
    - (2) Employees?
    - (3) Communities?
    - (4) Federal agencies?
  - b. *Compared to the current employment verification program, what are the non-financial costs of implementing and maintaining pilot programs for:*
    - (1) Employers?
    - (2) Employees?
    - (3) Communities?
    - (4) Federal agencies?
  - c. *Are there major differences in the financial and non-financial costs of employment verification among different:*
    - (1) Employers?
    - (2) Employees?
    - (3) Communities?
    - (4) Federal offices?
  - d. *Is there a way to avoid or reduce costs incurred when employers hire people, buy them uniforms, and train them and then find out that they are not work-authorized?*
  - e. *Do INS and SSA have adequate procedures to measure and determine the costs for exception processing?*
2. **Does the employment verification system result in any indirect cost savings?**
  - a. *Does employment verification have the side benefit of improving the accuracy of SSA records?*
3. **Do employment verification procedures place an undue burden on certain employers, employees, Federal staff, or others?**
  - a. *Do administrative and management requirements place a major burden on some or all participating employers?*
  - b. *Do employers perceive employment verification to be unduly burdensome?*
  - c. *Do work-authorized employees perceive the secondary verification process to be unduly burdensome?*
  - d. *Do the pilot programs create an undue burden on employees by requiring large numbers of people to contact the agencies to resolve discrepancies in work authorization?*
  - e. *Do employees perceive employment verification to be unduly burdensome?*
  - f. *What are the experiences of work-authorized employees who fail initial verification?*

## Specific Research Questions Related to Fair Information Practices

1. **Do authorized individuals use the employment verification system in non-authorized ways?**
  - a. *What information can employers obtain from the system that can be used against the employee?*
  - b. *What information can employers obtain from the system that they cannot easily obtain from other sources?*
  - c. *Are authorized individuals disclosing information from the INS or SSA pilot systems to non-authorized individuals?*
  - d. *Do employers use the verification system to screen job applicants before they are hired?*
  - e. *Do employers use the verification system to check the records of employees other than recent hires?*
  - f. *Is initial non-verification communicated to the employee in a private setting?*
  - g. *Do employers impose penalties if employees (e.g., in human resources) use the employment verification databases improperly?*
  - h. *If penalties are imposed for using the employment verification databases improperly, are the relevant employees aware of these penalties and do the penalties act as a deterrent?*
2. **Is the employment verification system perceived as being intrusive?**
  - a. *Do employees perceive the employment verification procedures as intrusive?*
  - b. *Do other community members perceive the employment verification procedures as intrusive?*
  - c. *Do other stakeholders perceive the employment verification procedures as intrusive?*
3. **How secure are the data systems from access and use by non-authorized persons?**
  - a. *Do employers take reasonable precautions to ensure that only authorized employees have access to the system?*
  - b. *Do the INS and SSA systems used in the pilots have adequate built-in accounting or audit functions to track system use and identify security breaches?*
  - c. *Do the INS and SSA systems used in the pilots have adequate built-in processes to verify the authenticity of a user or process?*
  - d. *Is there any evidence that the security of the INS and SSA systems used in the pilots has, in fact, been breached?*
4. **Do the databases used for employment verification contain potentially harmful inaccuracies?**
  - a. *Do the INS and SSA systems used in the pilots have adequate processes to guard against the modification or destruction of data, software, or system configurations?*
  - b. *Do the INS and SSA systems used in the pilots have adequate systems to monitor system and data availability?*
  - c. *Do the INS and SSA systems used in the pilots use automated edit procedures or other data editing capabilities to detect and correct inconsistent data?*

- d. Do INS and SSA utilize quality measurement systems to track and improve data accuracy in their systems?*
- e. How are government employees prevented from making unauthorized changes in INS and SSA files?*
- 5. Can (and does) INS share information about non-verification with its investigative arm or other enforcement agencies?**
  - a. Are members of the INS employment verification staff permitted, by law, to share information from employers with other INS groups or with other Federal or State agencies?*
  - b. To what extent, if any, is the information collected from employers currently shared with other groups within INS or with other Federal or State agencies?*

## Specific Research Questions Related to Discrimination

1. **Do employers implement pilot procedures in a non-discriminatory fashion?**
  - a. *Do employers develop, eliminate, or modify discriminatory practices as a result of pilot participation?*
    - (1) Do employers participating in the pilot programs develop (or alter their use of) practices to proactively prevent employment discrimination?
      - (a) Have recruitment procedures, such as advertising in minority papers or using employment agencies specializing in finding minority candidates, changed since the implementation of the pilot programs?
      - (b) Have hiring procedures changed since the implementation of the pilot programs?
    - (2) Do discriminatory practices arise among employers participating in the pilot?
  - b. *Do employers selectively verify work authorization, by demographic group?*
  - c. *Do employers treat all employees the same, pending final verification, without regard to appearance, accent, or other non-work-related characteristics?*
  - d. *Is employer determination of document acceptability, and of which documents are required in Form I-9, related to demographic characteristics?*
  - e. *Are employer failures to follow required procedures related to history of problems with INS, EEO, or other Federal regulations?*
  - f. *As a result of the pilots, do employers steer some demographic groups away from jobs having high-turnover costs?*
2. **Do INS and SSA implement pilot procedures in a non-discriminatory fashion?**
  - a. *Do INS and SSA implement procedures in the same way for all employers?*
  - b. *Do INS and SSA implement procedures in the same way for all employees?*
  - c. *Does INS use information about the pilots to determine whether sweeps or audits are warranted?*
3. **What are the outputs from the computer systems used by the pilots?**
4. **Do the outputs from the pilots suggest that discrimination is occurring?**
  - a. *Are employers less likely to put members of certain demographic groups through the primary or secondary verification systems?*
  - b. *Are employers more likely to use the verification systems to prescreen members of certain demographic groups?*
  - c. *Are work-authorized employees with non-English names and/or surnames more likely to receive tentative nonconfirmations on primary verification?*
  - d. *Are work-authorized women more likely than work-authorized men to receive tentative nonconfirmations on primary verification?*
  - e. *Does the percentage of employees receiving accurate, timely information from employers on how to reconcile their records differ by demographic group?*
  - f. *Does the percentage of work-authorized employees able to reconcile their records through secondary verification differ by demographic group?*
  - g. *Do the percentages of SSA or INS database inaccuracies differ by demographic group?*



- h. *Are employers more likely to terminate or otherwise negatively treat certain demographic groups as a result of the employment verification outputs?*
  - i. *Is the incidence of authorized persons quitting prior to the final determination of work authorization related to their demographic characteristics?*
- 5. Are the outcomes and impacts of the pilots discriminatory?**
- a. *Do employers participating in the pilots discriminate less than previously, due to decreased fear that they will inadvertently employ a non-work-authorized person?*
  - b. *Have firms, especially those with a history of discrimination, maintained the proportion of their workforce composed of different demographic groups?*
  - c. *Do the pilots lead to increased (or decreased) differences among demographic groups in terms of hours worked, earnings, training, and/or task assignments?*
  - d. *Do employees perceive the pilot programs as being discriminatory?*
  - e. *Does the percentage of employees perceiving the pilot programs as discriminatory vary among demographic subgroups?*
  - f. *Does public opinion in pilot communities indicate that anti-immigrant sentiment has increased, because of the pilots?*
- 6. Are costs unevenly distributed among different employee groups?**
- a. *Do different groups of work-authorized employees experience different levels of burden as a result of the pilots?*
  - b. *Do work-authorized members of some demographic groups find it more difficult to reconcile their records in the secondary verification process?*
- 7. How do the characteristics of employers, employees, Federal offices, and communities affect employment verification and related processes?**
- a. *Is the incidence of authorized persons quitting or being fired prior to the final determination of work authorization related to race/ethnicity, surname, English proficiency or accent, gender, or disability status?*
  - b. *Is the incidence of unauthorized persons being authorized to work related to race/ethnicity, surname, English proficiency or accent, gender, or disability status?*
  - c. *Is there a difference in duration of employment, promotion rate, time to promotion, job satisfaction, or other job measures between employees who achieve primary verification and those who are verified at a later stage?*
    - (1) *Do employers develop discriminatory recruiting practices as a result of participating in the pilot programs?*
    - (2) *Is the training of employees responsible for implementing employment verification correlated with a reduction in adverse effects?*
    - (3) *Do co-workers discourage certain types of employees from contesting initial non-verification?*
    - (4) *Do managers or supervisors discourage certain types of employees from contesting initial non-verification?*
    - (5) *Do community groups reduce job candidate referrals to employers participating in the pilot programs?*

- (6) Does the extra step in the citizen attestation pilot lead to more discrimination?
- 8. **Do community members perceive the pilots as increasing discrimination in the community?**

## Specific Research Questions Related to Other Economic and Social Implications

1. **What are the effects of the pilots on immigration?**
  - a. *Do the pilots deter unauthorized immigrants from entering this country?*
  - b. *What happens to workers fired as a result of an INS audit? What does this imply about the likely effect of the pilots on deterring illegal immigration?*
  - c. *Do employers, employees, and other stakeholders report that the pilots appear to be decreasing unauthorized immigration?*
2. **What are the effects of the pilots on the legitimate labor market?**
  - a. *Do the pilots deter non-work-authorized immigrants from obtaining work?*
    - (1) Is there evidence that some potential non-work-authorized employees avoid employers participating in the pilot program?
    - (2) Do employee resignations among non-work-authorized employees hired prior to the start of the pilots increase or decrease as a result of the pilots?
    - (3) Do employers, employees, and other stakeholders report that the pilots are preventing non-work-authorized immigrants from obtaining work?
  - b. *Do the pilots deter work-authorized individuals from obtaining work?*
    - (1) Do work-authorized people apply to pilot employers less frequently than before?
    - (2) Do employee resignations among work-authorized employees hired prior to the start of the pilots increase (or decrease) as a result of the pilots?
    - (3) Do employees with legal work authorization who fail primary verification try to find work with employers not participating in the verification pilots?
    - (4) Do employers, employees, and other stakeholders report that the pilots are preventing work-authorized immigrants from obtaining work?
  - c. *Do the pilots make it easier or harder for work-authorized individuals to obtain work?*
  - d. *Do the pilots lead to worker shortages?*
  - e. *What is the impact of the pilots on unemployment and wage rates?*
  - f. *Do nonparticipating employers gain a competitive advantage (or disadvantage) over those who participate?*
    - (1) Do employers that choose to retain employees who have received final nonconfirmation realize cost, workforce availability, or other competitive advantages over employers who terminate such employees?
    - (2) Do non-participating employers within the same economic sector realize cost, workforce availability, or other competitive advantages over participating employers?
    - (3) Will some firms experiencing a decrease in the applicant pool or higher wages be driven out of business?
  - g. *To what extent are community members aware of the pilots?*

3. **What are the effects of the pilots on other parts of the macro-economic system?**
  - a. *Do the pilots lead to an expansion of the underground economy?*
  - b. *Are some individuals paid “off the books”? If so, what are the implications of this for employment verification?*
  - c. *Do the pilots lead to an increase in the number of immigrants who rely on begging or charity to support themselves?*
4. **What are the effects of the employment verification pilots on the lives of employees and potential employees?**
  - a. *Do work-authorized employees who receive a tentative nonconfirmation experience increased stress or withdrawal behaviors or reduce their organizational citizenship behaviors?*
  - b. *Do other employees at pilot firms experience increased stress or withdrawal behaviors or reduce their organizational citizenship behaviors?*
  - c. *Do work-authorized immigrants avoid seeking employment with participating employers because of the verification process?*
  - d. *Do employees perceive the pilot programs as increasing fairness in employment practices?*
  - e. *What happens to the employee if the INS document is inaccurate or out of date? How does a worker prove to SSA or INS that he/she is authorized to work?*

## Specific Research Questions Related to National Implications

1. **What are the implications of observed differences between participating employers, employees, communities, and Federal offices for generalizing the results of the pilots to the nation as a whole?**
  - a. *Do program outcomes and impacts differ depending upon employer, employee, Federal office, or community characteristics?*
  - b. *Are there differences in processes, outputs, outcomes, and impacts between those employers “required” to participate and those that participate voluntarily?*
    - (1) Do firms required to participate in a pilot program because they were found to be in violation of INAS Section 274(a)(1) or 274B differ from otherwise similar firms that elected to participate in the same pilot?
    - (2) Do Federal divisions that have been ordered to change their hiring and promotional practices because of past discrimination differ from other Federal divisions?
2. **Are INS pilot projects representative of practices likely to exist in a large-scale implementation of work-authorization verification? For example, are firms in the pilots given a lot of special attention?**
  - a. *What are the likely impacts of a nationwide system on INS and SSA resources?*
  - b. *What would it cost for a comprehensive, effective enforcement program to make the system work?*
  - c. *What is the impact of automated employment verification on other Federal agencies?*
  - d. *What are the barriers and facilitators to implementing nationwide automated employer verification from the viewpoint of the stakeholders (employers, employees, the public, opinion leaders, etc.)?*
  - e. *How do the evaluation technologies used to assess the pilots affect the pilot processes themselves?*
    - (1) Do employers and Federal staff act differently than they normally would because they know the pilot study is being watched carefully?
    - (2) To what extent do programmatic changes made by Federal staff in response to preliminary evaluation findings make it difficult to generalize to a future national program?
    - (3) What is the interrelationship between the different pilot systems being tested? Will one tend to undermine the others?
  - f. *What other methodological concerns might limit the generalizability of the results?*
    - (1) Are sample sizes sufficiently large to ensure reliable estimates of the critical variables?
    - (2) Are samples representative of the groups of interest?
    - (3) How have employer procedures changed over time?
    - (4) Are employers’ new hire lists valid? If not, how will this affect the evaluation?

- (5) What are the likely impacts of a nationwide system (as distinct from the pilot system) on INS and SSA resources? What would be needed to implement a nationwide program?
- (6) Are other tests (e.g., drug tests) required in addition to the employment verification? (If so, it will be necessary to identify which individuals are fired because of these other tests rather than because of employment verification.)
- g. *What are the implications of the pilots for a national identity card?*
- h. *What is the likely impact of a national program on the macro-economy?*
  - (1) What is the likelihood that labor shortages or wage increases might cause significant numbers of businesses to fail?
  - (2) What is the likelihood of local or regional dislocations in labor markets?
  - (3) What is the likelihood of adverse effects on entire industries?
  - (4) What is the likely magnitude of such effects?